

*From the Lost Teaching of Polycarp: Identifying Irenaeus' Apostolic Presbyter and the Author of Ad Diognetum*

Charles E. Hill

WUNT 186; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2006, 3-16-148699-4, €49.00, ix + 207 hb

This is a book in two parts, each of which should be evaluated separately from the other. In the first part, Hill argues that Polycarp is the unnamed presbyter to whom Irenaeus refers in a number of points in his *Against Heresies*, most significantly in anti-Marcionite material found in 4.27-32. The material that he cites there is therefore to be identified with the oral teaching of Polycarp that Irenaeus states elsewhere (in his *Letter to Florinus*, preserved in Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History* 5.20.4-8) that he could still reproduce in many of the words that Polycarp used. Hill then reproduces, translates and comments on these fragments preserved by Irenaeus, and notes the consequences that his thesis has for our understanding of Polycarp, Marcion and Irenaeus. In the second part, Hill argues that Polycarp is also to be identified as the author of the *Letter to Diognetus* (which Hill takes to be a unity, not two different works). Certain differences between Polycarp's *Philippians* and *Diognetus* are explained on the basis that the former was written at a much earlier date than the latter.

Hill's command of both the primary evidence and secondary discussion is masterful, and the case that he makes is always plausible and often persuasive and/or compelling. I am convinced by Hill's arguments that Polycarp is almost certainly the unnamed presbyter to whom Irenaeus refers. I am less convinced, however, that we may confidently identify him as the author of *Diognetus*. Hill deals directly with NT texts only in passing, but this book makes an extremely important contribution to our understanding of early Christians who played an important role in the early stages of transmitting the texts later collected in the NT. Accessible to advanced undergraduates as well as to graduate students and scholars, this book deserves attention from anyone with an interest in the early Christians from among whom the canon emerged.

Andrew Gregory

*Other Early Christian Gospels: A Critical Edition of the Surviving Greek Manuscripts*

Andrew E. Bernhard

LNTS 315; London: T&amp;T Clark Intl, 2006, 0-567-04204-9, £60.00, xiv + 157 + 31 plates hb

Bernhard's timely study is a valuable addition to the fast-growing scholarly literature on the non-canonical gospels. His title is precise: the book covers all the available Greek (not Coptic) manuscripts containing parts of 'other' (that is, non-canonical) Christian gospels which might have been written in the first Christian century (30–130 CE). By 'gospel', he means any text dealing with 'the teachings and/or activities of Jesus during his adult life' (p. 2). This tight definition unfortunately excludes infancy or post-resurrection narratives, such as the *Gospel of Mary* (p. 2 n. 6). Included are the Greek fragments of the *Gospel of Thomas* (ch. 1), the *Gospel of Peter* (ch. 2), the *Unknown Gospel* (P. Egerton 2: ch. 3), and a number of small unidentified Gospel fragments (ch. 4). Each is presented with introduction, notes on the manuscripts and editions, critical Greek text with apparatus (showing lacunae and

restorations), restored Greek text, and English translation. A useful collection of photographs completes the volume.

As the publication of 'alternative gospels' becomes a new growth industry, both inside and outside the academy, this is an immensely useful introductory handbook, based on a new collation of the Greek manuscript evidence. The layout (on facing pages) makes it easy to compare the 'restored' text (on which the English translation is based) with the fragmentary original (to which Bernhard has added accents and breathings). For wider questions of identification, definition and dating, readers will have to turn to the major scholarly discussions to which Bernhard refers. In a fast-moving field, however, bibliography has to be continually updated: both April DeConick's important *Recovering the Original Gospel of Thomas* (Continuum 2005) and Larry Hurtado's *Earliest Christian Artefacts* (Eerdmans 2006) were in press when Bernhard wrote.

Loveday Alexander

*The Parting of the Ways: Between Christianity and Judaism and their Significance for the Character of Christianity*, 2nd edn

James D.G. Dunn

London: SCM, 2006 (1991), 0-334-02999-6, £24.99, xxxvi + 410 pb

After new editions of Dunn's *Christology in the Making* (2003) and *Unity and Diversity* (2005), SCM has now published an updated version of *The Parting of the Ways* of 1991. The main new elements are a 20-page preface and a 25-page concluding essay; the latter first appeared in the 1996 Martin Hengel *Festschrift*. The preface discusses the progress of research since the first edition; the essay asks questions about the identity of Judaism and Christianity and ventures into the Patristic era for some of its answers. Dunn indicates that the actual situation of the partings might be even more complicated than he described it, but he maintains that the metaphor of 'ways' is appropriate. Against Lieu he also defends his theological (i.e. not sociological) approach.

New publications have been taken into account in the additions, but the body of the text is still that of the first edition. This means that there is very limited interaction with recent publications such as those of Daniel Boyarin, Larry Hurtado, Judith Lieu and Tom Wright. It also means that the history of research in ch. 1 ends in 1989, that the publication of many Dead Sea scrolls including 4QMMT is still anticipated, and that phrases like 'the past fifteen years' (p. 21) should be counted backwards from 1991. For these reasons, as with *Unity and Diversity*, those who own the previous edition may not want to buy the new edition. There is one enormous improvement, though: the book now has footnotes instead of endnotes.

Pieter J. Lalleman

*Rhetoric and Reality in Early Christianities*

Willi Braun, ed.

ESCJ 16; Ontario: Wilfred Laurier, 2005, 0-88920-462-4, C\$32.99, xi + 257 hb

This volume discusses the rhetorical discourse of Christian groups beyond the standard text-based treatments. William Arnal analyses the relationship between